

# opción

Revista de Antropología, Ciencias de la Comunicación y de la Información, Filosofía,  
Linguística y Semiótica, Problemas del Desarrollo, la Ciencia y la Tecnología

Año 35, 2019, Especial N°

# 21

Revista de Ciencias Humanas y Sociales

ISSN 1012-1587/ ISSNe: 2477-9385

Depósito Legal pp 198402ZU45



Universidad del Zulia  
Facultad Experimental de Ciencias  
Departamento de Ciencias Humanas  
Maracaibo - Venezuela



## **The Substantive Representation Of Women In The Local Parliament Seats Above 30%**

**Juwita Hayyuning Prastiwi<sup>1\*</sup>, Tri Hendra Wahyudi<sup>2</sup>, Resya Famelasari<sup>3</sup>**

**<sup>1</sup>Department of Political Science, Brawijaya University  
Veteran Street, Malang, East Java, Indonesia, juwita\_hayyu@ub.ac.id;  
<sup>2</sup>tri\_hendra@ub.ac.id; <sup>3</sup>resyafamela@ub.ac.id**

### **Abstract**

**This study aims to analyze the effectiveness of achieving critical mass on women's performance in parliament. Using qualitative methodology and in-depth interviews as the main data collection techniques, research and analysis of the functions of legislation and representation in local parliaments are performed. Through representation theory, this research concludes that the achievement of critical mass does not end with critical action. This is because there are no critical female actors who understand the context and wish to fight against the interests of the party and parliament. The statement is influenced by, firstly, socio-political conditions called critical structures which constitute the institutional level of political parties and parliament has a dominant role in addressing issues in parliament. Secondly, the majority of women legislators have less strategic positions, either in political parties or in the structure of the parliamentary council. Thirdly, the quality of constituents determines the quality of aspirations, which are substantively often not related to practical or strategic gender needs.**

**Keywords: Critical Mass, Women, Local Parliament, Representation**

## **La Representación Sustantiva De La Mujer. En Los Escaños Del Parlamento Local Por Encima Del 30%**

### Resumen

Este estudio tiene como objetivo analizar la efectividad de lograr una masa crítica en el desempeño de las mujeres en el parlamento. Utilizando una metodología cualitativa y entrevistas en profundidad como las principales técnicas de recopilación de datos, se realizan investigaciones y análisis de las funciones de la legislación y la representación en los parlamentos locales. A través de la teoría de la representación, esta investigación concluye que el logro de la masa crítica no termina con una acción crítica. Esto se debe a que no hay actores femeninos críticos que entiendan el contexto y deseen luchar contra los intereses del partido y el parlamento. La declaración está influenciada, en primer lugar, por condiciones socio-políticas llamadas estructuras críticas que constituyen el nivel institucional de los partidos políticos y el parlamento tiene un papel dominante en el tratamiento de los problemas en el parlamento. En segundo lugar, la mayoría de las legisladoras tienen posiciones menos estratégicas, ya sea en los partidos políticos o en la estructura del consejo parlamentario. En tercer lugar, la calidad de los componentes determina la calidad de las aspiraciones, que a menudo no están relacionadas con las necesidades prácticas o estratégicas de género.

Palabras clave: masa crítica, mujeres, parlamento local, representación

### 1. INTRODUCTION

In history, discrimination against women participating in political elections has been identified by certain condition, such as socio-cultural beliefs, attitude, and stereotypes in developed countries (KOSOMO, 2012; ODUOL, 2003). Not only for the election process, parliament has its critical condition for women. In Pakistan, women do not have adequate votes or presence in parliament because occupation of the hegemony of public space leaves very little room for women's participation in politics (AHMAD, et al. 2019). Some research has been done on the parliaments in Uganda (GOETZ, 2002), Switzerland (GILARDI, 2014), Rwanda (DEVLIN & ELGIE, 2008), and Poland (GWIAZDA, 2013). The increasing

number of women in Uganda's parliament occurred through the elite movement and patronage system. Women's representation is not growing properly and equality does not occur in the legislation process. In Switzerland, new female candidates and an improvement in women's representation happened because of role models in the early stage and become a motivation for females as an underrepresented group. In Rwanda, women's representation reached 48.75% and women's issues are much easier to be part of the policy agenda, but there is still less power to influence on policy output. In Poland in 2011, the gender quota was pushed through rule of law and explained the policy change. A survey of women and men in various parliaments in 2008 by the Inter-parliamentary Union concluded that women have different interests and concerns for political life. Women tend to emphasize social issues, including childcare, equal pay, parental leave and pensions, gender-based violence, poverty, etc. Mostly women believe that parliament is still dominated by men and substantial change is small. Women in parliament faced difficulty to change the political structure. Fewer women is a deficit for democracy, so equity in gender quota provides parliament with more substantial issues (IPU, 2008). This research complements previous study to describe how political change and the representative and legislation function occurred after the increasing number of women's quota in Indonesia's parliament. This research is focused on updating the effectiveness of women's representation after the 30% quota has been reached.

In Indonesia, the equity representation among men and women reached by gender quota is 30% as critical mass. The idea of critical mass has been introduced for almost 50 years and is popular as a concept for analyzing women's political performance in parliament. This concept assumed that a certain numbers in parliament implicated changes in parliamentary political behavior and decisions, including changing on legislation products more friendly to women. Introduced by Robert Moss Kanter (1977) and Drude Dahlerup (1988), the following concept became a global concern and was emphasized by the United Nations,

The notion of a critical mass is supported by a 1992 study by the United Nations, which concludes that only a critical mass of 30% to 35% of women in politics will make a significant difference to the political culture due to the priority women give to the needs of other women, children, elderly, disabled, and disadvantaged (KUREBWA & NDLOVU, 2017, p. 27)

In order to deliver the critical mass concept, technical arrangements are presented as affirmation policies. Affirmation policy means the political will to guarantee involvement of women in the political space. The political will brings awareness of the unequal structure of society in that women are marginalized, ignored and exploited. Through affirmative policies, access or opportunities for women, their interest is guaranteed.

The first manifestation of affirmation policy in Indonesia was implemented by at least a 30% quota of women as members of parliament since the 2004 election. After that period, other rules tried to support the fulfillment of the minimum quota, including zipper systems and women's quota in political party management. Unfortunately, these various regulations don't appear to have been enough to change the number or proportion of women's representation in parliament. The reason is because of the constitutional court decision to change the determination of candidates to be elected by serial numbers to the highest vote, thus increasing competition between candidates in both different parties and the same party.

Unfortunately for women, the constitutional court's decision is one obstacle that, intertwined with others, such as lack of political experience, limited political resources, and the existing culture, prevents women from being elected. All of these obstacles are certainly rooted in patriarchal thinking, which contributes to the difficulties of women to fill parliamentary seats. The weakness of women's bargaining position is once issues that should be accommodated in parliamentary political processes.

At the national issue, several policies containing protection of women's interests that couldn't be completed until now include policies for domestic workers, the revision law of TKI (Indonesian worker placement and protection law), and polemic of the Elimination of Sexual Violence Law. At the local issue, based on the release of Komnas Perempuan from 2009 to 2015, there are 389 regulations in the regions discriminating against women. Generally, discriminatory regulations in the regions regulate how women should dress, enforce prostitution cases, marriage arrangements, etc.

The 30% quota has never been reached nationally. However, the low accessibility of women to the national parliament does not occur at the local

level. In the 2014 election, 23 DPRD districts and cities were able to reach a minimum quota of 30% of women. In East Java, there are three cities which reached more than 30%, namely, Surabaya with 34%, Kediri with 30%, and Madiun with 33.3%. The question after that percentage is whether fulfilling the critical mass (as fulfillment of descriptive representation) is able to bring substantive representation through improving the performance of DPRD's in each region, making it more gender sensitive and friendly to women's interests.

The practice of representation relates to how a person or group of people is able to speak and act on behalf of the larger group. Theoretically, the four representation models by Hanna Pitkin are widely developed as references in the following period. The models include formal representation, symbolic representation, descriptive representation and substantive representation. However, among the four models, there are two models of feminists' main concerns: "... the practical application and interactions of two of Pitkin's concepts of substantive and descriptive have come under close feminist scrutiny... Empirical research on authorised and symbolic representation is somewhat limited" (CHILDS & LOVENDUSKI, 2012, p.3). The descriptive and substantive representation became the main points in feminist research, including Lovenduski in his book "Politics of Women's Relations" where he stressed that not all the female political actors are feminists (2008, p.61). Lovenduski confirmed the difference between descriptive and substantive representation and implied that descriptive representation does not necessarily end up being a substantive representation.

Descriptive representation models research relies on critical mass and substantive representations focused on critical acts which have previously been given to many other studies. As in the 1989 St. Germain study in America, specifically in the state of Arizona, where the number of women in parliament had reached 15%, which turned out to be quite effective in encouraging discussion on women's issues (STUDLAR & MCALLISTER, 2001, p.4).

However, studies have concluded there is a negative correlation between the number of women in parliament and attention to women's issues, such as the Macaulay (2005) study which showed that, in Bolivia, Argentina, Cuba and Costa Rica, the correlation between the number of women and

attention to women's issues was not proven. In line with Macaulay, Kurebwa and Ndlovu noted:

indeed as the number of studies grows, it is increasingly obvious that there is neither a universal nor a single relationship between the percentage of women elected to political office and the passage of decisions or legislations beneficial to women as a group (2017, p.26).

In Indonesia itself, studies have described a negative correlation between the achievement of critical mass and increasing attention on women's issues; these studies include HELENA MAGDALENA's (2015) research in the South Barito District, Tia Zatu IKRAMINA (2014) in Surabaya, MAI KARONIKA (2016) in Depok, and HUTAMI RIAULI GRACE (2017) in Surabaya. The conclusion or main findings of previous research is that, firstly, research related to the effectiveness of minimum quota in Indonesia has not been done. Secondly, these four studies see the effectiveness of women's quota only in terms of the legislation function and, thirdly, these four studies only looked at one DPRD case study.

This research is emphasized on identifying and analyzing the effectiveness among critical mass numbers and representation in three research locations, Surabaya, Kediri, and Madiun. Unlike previous research which only focused on legislative functions, this research is focused on the legislation and representation function in reaching for women's interests. The function of representation itself is necessary in the political process, because it becomes a means of activating and integrating female citizens at the grassroots level in political processes.

## 2. METHOD

The research scope analyzed women's parliament performance to practice substantive representative, which is defined by the effectiveness of women's performance to create legislation, including legislation function and integrating force with women's grassroots to solve various issues. Feminist research in general uses qualitative methods that are designed in a manner to reveal the behavior and perception of the target audience with reference to a particular topic and phenomena. The type of qualitative research is in-depth-interview to obtain primary data as the main source of the analysis process. For doing purposive sampling in interview techniques, the

researcher mapped the key informants. The result of mapping male and female parliament members in three regions was based on positions within political parties and institutions. The process of analyzing this research begins with classifying male and female data based on four aspects of gender gap measurement, including access, participation, control, and benefits in the practice of legislation and representation. The interview guidelines mainly discussed about how is women's parliament performance in Surabaya, Kediri, and Madiun in the implementation of legislative function and representative function with emphasis on social issues in each region.

As feminist research, this research practices a "feminist perspective" and seeks to uncover women's experiences and gender relations from the side of women. Trisakti Handayani, in "Concepts and Techniques of Gender Research", states a female perspective research explicitly states its alignments, which focuses on women's issues in which aspects of feelings and experiences of women are involved, then looks for strategies to change conditions that are not beneficial for women (2008, pp. 66-78).

In contrast to previous studies which tended to be partial in looking at one case of the DPRD itself, this study focused on Surabaya, Kediri, and Madiun because each region has succeeded in exceeding the critical mass number in East Java. Informants are DPRD members and were selected purposively, both women and men, w based on positions both internally in political parties and within local parliamentary institutions. In DPRD Surabaya, there are six informants, including Mochamad Machmud as the chairman of the legislature, secretary of the Democratic Party faction, a member of Commission C and others. In Kediri there are four informants, including Sriana as the chairman of the legislature, Gerindra Party faction, a member of Commission A and others. In Madiun, there are six informants, including Supiyah Mangayu Hastuti as deputy chairman of the PDI-P Faction, the secretary of Commission II, a member of the Deliberation Board and other informants. In addition to interviews, this research also relies on many data presented by research or other sources of documents related to the implementation of DPRD functions in the three cities, such as reports of female DPRD recesses.

The process of analyzing begins with identifying and sorting male and female data, based on four aspects of gender gap measurement including access, participation, control, and benefits in the practice of legislation and

representation. Next, the data are categorized based on certain criteria, and then interpreted using a conceptual and representation theory.

### 3. RESULT AND DISCUSSION

Women's representation in politics is necessary because there are a special interest and range of experiences that are only represented by women. According to the UN Women and UNDP (2015), "as voters, candidates, electoral administrators, or party supporters - they can express their own needs and interests. Decisions better reflect the electorate. Political processes are more inclusive. Democracy is strengthened."

According to the statement, it clearly shows the existence of special interest, unique situations and the range of experiences of women that only women might represent, the presence also brings a more maternalistic democratic life and it has implications for society as a whole.

How women achieved these things is based on empirical studies in some countries and a National Democratic Institute (NDI) article titled "Why Women in Politics" which mentioned five political practices able to bring changes, through: 1) Women work across party lines, 2) Women lawmakers are highly responsive to constituent concern, 3) Women help secure lasting peace, 4) Women's participation encourages citizen confidence in democracy, and 5) Women prioritize education, health, and other key development indicators.

There are quite a number of studies that support increasing the presence of women in politics, which, in turn, leads to the global effort to provide affirmative action for women, including in Indonesia. However, at the national level, women have never reached the critical mass figure of 30%. While, at the local level, out of a total of 403 Regency / City DPRDs in Indonesia, there are 23 DPRDs - meaning around 9.89%, which have been able to reach critical mass numbers.

Although the change is slow, the other side for regulatory factors seems to be quite successful in influencing the increasing number of women in the legislative, especially at the local level. So, it is interesting to see what women legislators in Indonesia are doing, carrying out their roles as, especially based on literature, there is no depiction of empirical practices of

women's representation at the local level which are intact enough to see the relation of achieving 30% quota toward the implementation of legislative functions.

### 3.1. Legislation Function

Representation assumes that those who do not attend can have their views and interests presented, with or without the consent of the parties present. The presence of 30% of women in three cities (Surabaya, Kediri, and Madiun) is certainly expected to be a catalyst for democratic practices that protect female citizens.

The practice of the legislative function is seen through two things, including the level of personal and institutional levels. At the personal level, this research sees the perceptions of women DPRD members, and their personal capabilities in generating women and child friendly policies. At the institutional level, this research is focused on the support and obstacles provided by the DPRD institutions and political parties, for women DPRD members.

In terms of gender issues, each city has specific instances. In Surabaya, for example, in 2017 there were 26 cases of domestic violence, 219 infant mortality cases and 34 maternal mortality incidences. In Kediri, in the same year, there were 114 babies with malnutrition, the difference in wages of men and women was quite high at 554,198, and 2013-2016 revealed cases of child predators with a considerable number of victims. Whereas, in Madiun, the gender disaggregated data provided by BPS are not as complete as the two previous cities, so researchers did not succeed in identifying a significant gender gap; however, based on the search of mass media, there were cases of online prostitution and corruption cases in the development of Central Market (Pasar Besar) which attracted considerable attention in the last five years.

For accommodating the gender issues as mentioned above, there has generally been changes (albeit minimal) in the three locations. Among the changes is the existence of gender sensitive legislation initiatives that did not exist in the previous period. In the last five years, Surabaya has seen Regional Regulation on the Prevention and Handling of Victims of Trafficking in Persons, then, in Kediri, there is Regional Regulation (Perda) on

the Implementation of Protection of Women and Children and Perda concerning the Implementation of Child Friendly City Development. , while Madiun has Regional Regulation on the Implementation of Child Friendly Cities and Regional Regulation on the Protection of Women and Children Victims of Violence. Improvement in policy-output has been reached despite little change.

The process of drafting regulations it is firstly noted that, especially for the child-friendly city regulations, it is actually a mandate from the national level regulation. In Minister of Women's Empowerment and Child Protection Regulation No. 11 of 2011 concerning Development of Child-Friendly Districts / Cities, it is mentioned:

That government affairs in the field of child protection includes policies, programs and activities to ensure the fulfillment of children's rights so that children can live, grow, develop, and participate optimally in accordance with human dignity, and get protection from violence and discrimination is obligate by local government, region or city

Secondly, the existence of gender sensitive regional regulations is limited to the fulfillment of practical gender issues rather than strategic ones. Thirdly, gender issues are generally accommodated as limited to local regulations with "themes of women and or children", while, in other local regulations, gender mainstreaming is not the basis of the legislation process.

Historically, the existence of regional regulations (perda) in the 1945 Constitution (prior to the amendments) was unknown, so that the regional regulations were marginalized in the arrangement of laws and regulations. Only after the 1945 Constitution was signed was the existence of regional regulations confirmed in a constitutional manner, as outlined in Article 18 paragraph (6) which reads in full "Regional Governments have the right to stipulate regional regulations and other regulations to carry out autonomy and assistance tasks."

So, based on mandate of the constitution and no longer orders from the law, the regional government has an autonomy to stipulate the legislations. Practically, in establishing regulations, regional government needs to understand the constitutional right given by the 1945 Constitution. This right regulates matters according to executive initiatives and legislative

initiatives. However, the regional government has to be careful to create substance that is considered sufficient knowledge and that the legislative product is produced responsively.

More specifically, there are two aspects that cannot be separated from the practice of implementing DPRD functions, including the administrative technical aspects related to public decision-making mechanism procedures, while the second is the more substantial aspects related to the ability and skills in converting constituent interests to become public policy. In the implementation of both, there is a power relation between the actors involved so that it requires a strategy to be able to produce appropriate and wise public decisions.

From the results of this research in general, all informants had a basic knowledge about gender. Dyah Katarina from PDI Perjuangan faction in Surabaya said:

Representation of women in parliamentary seats is very important, because women are more diligent, for example, the recess period, especially women, will complain and having better and enjoy communication and they find it easier to explore what is actually perceived by women, I don't think for males, they think more about physical revival, like the necessity of buildings issue

But, practically, women parliament members are not practicing their gender understanding well. Machmud, the chairman of the legislative board of DPRD Surabaya argued:

Especially for women's case, depending on the person, if they have a lot of organizational experience, so they also speak actively. But, if the person's background is housewife or an officer, there are those who keep silent for five years. For example, there are three different topics, like BUMD and youth issues, in each meeting so broad insight, knowledge, and decent intellectuals are needed

As an implication, they have difficulties in identifying a gender problem, and then this becomes an obstacle for women members of parliament to bring an agenda into legislations product.

The weakness of women legislators in identifying gender problems has implications for the implementation of the functions of legislation and representation. In Madiun, for example, the online prostitution case had been crowded at the beginning of 2019 and did not get meaningful response from DPRD Madiun. There was a similar condition in Surabaya and Kediri, where the closure of localization in these two cities did not become a concern for the DPRD, both in the form of local regulations and in the form of involvement of ex-localization communities in the parliament recess period.

In addition to the substantive aspects above, from the administrative technical aspects there resulted a lack of a number of gender-sensitive local regulations, contributed by the ability of the women legislators in technical legal drafting. For example, in questions about academic texts, there is a tendency for them not read or pay attention to texts that are philosophical, sociological or juridical as the political basis of a local regulation. During the 2014-2019 period in Kediri, MPs produced 27 perda, Surabaya produced 46 perda, and Madiun City produced 22 perda. During that period, Surabaya produced one gender-sensitive regulation and the two other cities produced two gender-sensitive regulations, which means that the number of local regulations targeting women did not, on average, reach 1% of the total regional regulations that were successfully compiled.

Based on Pitkin's representation model, affirmative policy is an effort to correct inequality that discriminates women to encourage descriptive representation through the fulfillment of critical mass. The substantial representation concept of Hanna Pitkin is used to examine the process of representation, which means members of parliament are examined as to what extent they produced the policy outcome.

Theoretically, the critical mass concept referring to numbers has been widely criticized because it does not always produce substantial representation, so that other concepts emerge, such as critical act, critical actors and critical structures. If critical mass is associated with a representative "standing for", then the critical act is associated with "acting for". In this critical act concept, representation of women is challenged, since not all women can act on behalf of and for women.

Results of this research find that the critical act in the practice of substan-

tive representation is lacking by every parliamentary woman. However, there is a feminization of parliament practice which results to change the political way of parliament. According to Nurrudin from the Council of Kediri:

With the minimum number of women routinely active in the office, women are more disciplined than men. The positive value is women are more active and pro-active. They are able to display a more positive side, both in behavior, activeness, and participation in the public space

Without reducing the positive side of feminization of parliament, more substantially, the critical act is only possible by critical actors, “people who initiate policy proposals on their own, even when women form a small minority and embolden others to take steps to promote policies for women” (KUREBWA, 2017, p.28).

According to this research, not every woman legislator is a critical actor. Interestingly, even when they are part of the local party leadership and leadership of parliament, they do not necessarily fight on behalf of women; not all women present in parliament are brave and able to represent women.

There are variations in the number of women who succeeded in holding positions in parliamentary leadership such as the chairman, vice chairman, secretary and treasurer. In Surabaya, the number of leader positions is six out of 17 people (35%). In Kediri, there are four women in leader positions out of 11 people (36%), while in Madiun there are female parliamentary leaders out of 10 (20%). Based on these data, women with strategic positions exist in all cities, but the number is still small and still dominated by just a few names. The phenomenon certainly showed achievement of critical mass, but does not necessarily produce a critical act as shown by the low number of strategic women in parliament.

At the institutional level, the critical structures concept has its place. The concept defines that the “structural elements of each country’s political system and environment exert a strong influence on women’s effective participation in policy-making” (KUREBWA, 2017, p.29). From the critical structure, the practical aspect of legislative function by women legislators has to deal with resistance by the male majority and the political

party. The challenge of women is not just from the personal level, but also the institutional level.

Behind the minimum legislation gender product in each city, the political process is often ignored in measuring the performance of women legislators. In Madiun's case, such initiatives from women are related to improvement of the quality of education in primary and secondary education for children and in alleviating financing. However, the regulation draft was rejected at the plenary meeting because the initiators failed to influence the DPRD majority members and the issue was not a priority supported by the majority parliamentary coalitions. In Surabaya's case, based on the recognition of women legislators, they have difficulties in managing strategic forums in DPRD. This is because women legislators don't have strategic positions on the board and it brings about failure in priority discussion meetings. In the three cities, generally, even is the women are either in strategic or non-strategic positions, the majority are powerless in factions, commissions, and DPRD bodies and the decision is fully determined by political parties.

The role of political parties limits the role of women. Therefore, few female legislators are able to access leadership seats in both political parties and parliament. In Kediri, is WRP, who-occupied strategic positions as the deputy chairman of the DPRD, deputy chairman of budget bodies, and also the vice chairman of deliberative bodies. The recognition from civil society groups is not actively recognized, as the strategic positions were secured by sibling power. He was the older brother of the DPP leader who was also a minister in the Jokowi Cabinet. In Surabaya, there are EC and DK, who are the wives of the big party political leaders in Indonesia and Surabaya.

The power of oligarchy influences parliament institutionalization practices. According to Jeffrey Winters, "Oligarchy is the most patriarchal world in the world. If there is a certain group in power because of a lot of capital, wealth based on wealth, then usually he will be very masculine" (2014, p. 162). The implication of this oligarchic practice weakens the bargaining power of women legislators in confrontation with the party and parliamentary forces, which often do not prioritize women's political agenda.

### 3.2. Representation Function

The implementation of the three main functions of representative institutions is legislation, budgeting, and supervision, which are carried out within the framework of people's representation. The concept of people here is often faced with constituent terms, which is limited to electoral voters. The function of representation should be interpreted as representation of people who fight for the interests of all people, not just community groups (ULFAH, 2017, p. 63).

Based on representation, women legislators assume that constituents are their voters, and they do not respect of their plurality of constituent status, including aspect of gender (gender neutral). Mrs. Tri Rahayu from Kediri said, "the groups I met in recess were only my constituents groups who choose me." Rina Haryati from Madiun said, "Almost all members, whoever comes, Mrs. Rina usually welcomes them to her constituency because she is their representative." The implications of a gender-neutral perspective would certainly be a barrier to the accommodation of women's interest in parliamentary policies.

Even though the viewpoint of women legislators tends to be gender neutral, based on the recess reports in the three cities, they meet more female constituents than male constituents. So, even though they have understanding of the constituents, they do not take gender aspects into account; practically, they are involved more in grassroots women's groups than other groups.

The finding of this research is that female citizens are sufficiently active in the political arena. However, there are at least two points to their constituency, firstly, grassroots groups are limited to traditional civil society groups, such as PKK groups (groups for empowering family welfare) and recitations rather than NGOs. In the recess period, women parliamentary members never met NGOs as a strategic group to support their aspirations and their work. Secondly, aspiration quality never touches gender interest, practically or strategically. Tri Rahayu argued that "mostly housewives requested a PKK uniform and recreation trip without it being related to women's rights demand".

The quality of constituent demand is linear to the quality of aspirations. The absence of a network between women council members and NGOs occurs in the three cities. In some cases, for example in Surabaya, the net-

work has actually been formed since 2009 through a joint forum for women's representation (FBKP) in Surabaya, but they are not solid, so it affects the capacity to identify social problems and their ability to influence the legislative process is not optimal. The same condition is found in the Kediri region where the emergence of political women has not significantly affected the role of women DPRD members in the city.

In Madiun and its surroundings, which include the City and Regencies of Madiun, Magetan, Ponorogo, Ngawi, Pacitan, Nganjuk and Trenggalek, the initial enthusiasm for the necessity to build solidarity among women DPRD members and stakeholders in the issue of gender justice, saw the formation of the Indonesian Parliamentary Women Caucus (KPPI) in 2009. The caucus consists of all DPRD members in the district / city who also build networks with KPPI and Other Kab / Cities in East Java. This caucus in Madiun is called the Madiun Women's Caucus, which includes the City of Madiun, Madiun Regency, Ponorogo Regency, Magetan Regency and Nganjuk Regency and Ngawi Regency.

Substantially, the strength of relations between women DPRD members with NGO networks, media and academics is limited to produce a map of gender problems and social problems and usually accompanied by policy recommendations in parliament. When the recommendations were included in the parliamentary political process, the role of non-parliamentary political caucus actors (NGOs and academics) became limited and even completely closed. Caucus is not related to gender issues because there are dominant variables in parliament that have more authority in determining the final outcome of parliamentary political decisions.

At this point, Pitkin's theoretical perspective emphasizes aspects of representation in 'subjects representing' (the representatives) found serious obstacles. In fact, in the context of local parliaments in Indonesia, women legislators never become an autonomous subject able to express freely and represent their constituents. They also have institutional problems such as political party, factions, and another DPRD board that is, in reality, dominated by legislators without a gender perspective. For example, when determining groups and activities during recess, especially in Surabaya and Madiun, the schedule of each member of the DPRD is determined by the secretariat council. In addition, the authority of political parties in conducting PAW or recall of members who do not obey instructions is

certainly also a scourge for every DPRD member.

In other words, the relationship between constituents and women DPRD members in the three cities actually does not show an ideal relationship between representatives and those represented, because, in addition to some of the aspirations carried out by women legislators coming from the interests of the party and faction, the quality of grassroots aspirations is low. The quality of grassroots aspirations is reminiscent of Saward's criticism of Pitkin's "The Concept or Representation", in that Pitkin's main focus was on the representative not on the party represented; as such, Pitkin's approach was one-way and ignored the process (IRWANSYAH, 2013, p .100). As a result, Pitkin's view considered the parties represented as interest groups that are stable, clear and accessible.

Regarding the capacity and representation function of women legislators, this study found that the low personal capacity of women legislators is not an independent thing, but the result of a complicated and stressful political process. Thus, looking at parliamentary practices only from the implementation of the DPRD's function as a reference for measuring the performance of women legislators, it seems unfair to be a generalization.

#### 4. CONCLUSION

On the one hand, the representation rate in the three cities has increased, but, on the other hand, the results of this research showed a lack of substantive representation practices in the three cities due to the dynamics in the practice of women's representation. Women DPRD members experienced various obstacles in carrying out their duties.

At the personal level, capabilities in delivering gender issue become a key so that substantive representation of women can be achieved. In this research it found that the gender knowledge of female legislators was good, but they have to face obstacles when this understanding has to be practiced in technical matters, such as legal drafting.

In order to achieve critical mass numbers, it does not end with the existence of the critical act, because there are no female critical actors who are able to understand the context and are willing to bear the struggle against the interests of the party and parliament. These three points are influenced

by socio-political conditions, called critical structures.

The conditions of critical structures or institutional contexts in this research are found to be strong and dominant. The roles of political parties determine, even limit, what parliamentary women can and cannot do. The conditions of these critical structures also influence the ability of consolidation among parliamentary women, for example in women's caucuses. The condition of non-consolidation of parliamentary women (especially across parties) has caused weak carrying capacity between them.

There are at least three things that can be deduced from the critical structures aspect, first, that political parties and parliaments often have a dominant role in delivering the issue of gender justice into parliament. Second, it is undeniable, as regardless the number of women DPRD members in one parliament, if they are not in a strategic position, both in political parties and in board fittings, the critical act to influence parliament's priority agenda will also not be significant. Third, the quality of the constituents also determines the quality of their aspirations, which is often not related to meeting the practical or strategic needs of gender. The accumulation of all of these ultimately determines the final outcome of the quality of women's representation in parliament.

Based on this conclusion, this study has weaknesses that can be resolved by future study. Another very important aspect, but not yet seen in this study, is a deeper research of the political struggle faced by female legislators, both in parliament and political parties. In addition, an in-depth study that examines the quality of the constituents represented, including the quality of their aspirations, could also determine the quality of representation, but it seems that studies on this are also rarely done.

## 5. ACKNOWLEDGMENTS

I would like to thank the Political Science Department of Brawijaya University. I give many thanks to all colleagues, and students in the Political Science Department who supported this research to the end. Thank you also to all informants who helped with the completion of this research.

## REFERENCES

- AHMAD, Akhlaq, et al. 2019. "Women in Democracy: The political Participation of Women". *Masyarakat, Kebudayaan, dan Politik*. Vol. 32, No 2: 114-122.
- DEVLIN, C., & ELGIE, R. 2008. "The Effect of Increased Women's Representation in Parliament: The Case of Rwanda". *Parliamentary Affairs*. Vol. 61, No 2: 237-254.
- GILARDI, Fabrizio. 2014. "The Temporary Importance of Role Models for Women's Political Representation". *American Journal of Political Science*. Vol. 0, No 0 August 2014: 1-14.
- GOETZ, Anne Marie. 2002. "No Shortcuts to Power: Constraints on Women's Political Effectiveness in Uganda". *The Journal of Modern African Studies*. Vol. 40, No. 4: 549-575.
- GRACE, Hutami Ria Uli. 2017. *Perempuan dan Politik-Studi Kasus Pelaksanaan Fungsi Legislasi Anggota Perempuan DPRD Kota Surabaya Periode 2014-2019*. Malang: Program Studi Ilmu Politik FISIP UB.
- GWIAZDA, Anna. 2015. "Women's Representation and Gender Quotas: The Case of the Polish Parliament". *Democratization*. Vol. 22, No 4: 679-697.
- INTER-PARLIAMENTARY UNION REPORT. 2008. *Equality in Politics: A Survey of Women and Men in Parliaments*. Switzerland.
- INTER-PARLIAMENTARY UNION REPORT. 2018. *Women in Parliament in 2018- The year in review*. Switzerland
- IKRAMINA, Tia Zatu. 2015. *Gender dan Politik Studi tentang Peran Anggota DPRD Perempuan di Kota Surabaya Periode 2009-2014 dalam Mewujudkan Kebijakan yang Responsif Gender*. Malang: FISIP UB.
- IRWANSYAH, et al. 2013. *Paradoks Representasi Politik Perempuan-Studi terhadap Perempuan Anggota DPRD Banten, DKI Jakarta, Jawa Barat*. Jakarta: Puskapol UI.
- KARONIKA, Mai. 2016. *Perempuan dan Politik - Analisis Peran Anggota Dewan Perempuan dalam Fungsi Legislasi di DPRD Kota Depok Periode 2014-2019*. Malang : Program Studi Ilmu Politik FISIP UB.
- KUREBWA, J., & NDLOVU, S. 2017. *The Critical Mass Theory and Quota Systems Debate*. *International Journal of Advanced Research and Publications*. Vol. 1, No 1.
- LOVENDUSKI, Joni. 2008. *Politik Berparitas Perempuan*. Yogyakarta: Penerbit Kanisius.
- LOVENDUSKI, J., & KARRAM, A. 2002. *Women in parliament Beyond Number dalam Buku International IDEA - Perempuan di parlemen bukan Sekedar Jumlah*. Jakarta: Aameepro.

MAGDALENA, Helena. 2015. Keterwakilan Perempuan di Lembaga Legislatif - Studi tentang Pelaksanaan Fungsi Legislasi di DPRD Kabupaten Barito Selatan Periode 2014 - 2019). Malang : Program Studi Ilmu Politik FISIP UB.

NATIONAL DEMOCRATIC INSTITUTE. 2016. Why Women in Politics. Washington: National Democratic Institute.

STUDLAR & MCALISTER. 2001. Does a Critical Mass Exist? A Comparative Analysis of Women's Legislative Representation Since 1949 - 1947. American Political Science Association.

ULFAH, I. R., et al. 2017. Kajian tentang Parlemen. Malang: UB Press.



**UNIVERSIDAD  
DEL ZULIA**

---

**opción**

Revista de Ciencias Humanas y Sociales

Año 35, Especial N° 21, (2019)

Esta revista fue editada en formato digital por el personal de la Oficina de Publicaciones Científicas de la Facultad Experimental de Ciencias, Universidad del Zulia.  
Maracaibo - Venezuela

[www.luz.edu.ve](http://www.luz.edu.ve)

[www.serbi.luz.edu.ve](http://www.serbi.luz.edu.ve)

[produccioncientifica.luz.edu.ve](http://produccioncientifica.luz.edu.ve)