

opción

Revista de Antropología, Ciencias de la Comunicación y de la Información, Filosofía,
Linguística y Semiótica, Problemas del Desarrollo, la Ciencia y la Tecnología

Año 35, 2019, Especial N°

20

Revista de Ciencias Humanas y Sociales

ISSN 1012-1537/ ISSNe: 2477-9385

Depósito Legal pp 198402ZU45



Universidad del Zulia
Facultad Experimental de Ciencias
Departamento de Ciencias Humanas
Maracaibo - Venezuela

Glass Ceiling Analysis in the Bureaucracy Within the Patriarchy and Religious Society

Fatimah Umar¹

¹Postgraduate School Universitas Airlangga, Surabaya, Indonesia
fatimah_umar@pasca.unair.ac.id

Musta'in Mashud²

²Faculty of Social and Political Sciences Universitas Airlangga, Surabaya,
Indonesia
mustain@fisip.unair.ac.id

Suryanto³

³Department of Personality and Social Psychology, Faculty of Psychology
Universitas Airlangga, Surabaya, Indonesia
suryanto@psikologi.unair.ac.id

dan Syafatania⁴

⁴Faculty of Psychology Universitas Airlangga, Surabaya, Indonesia
fatimah.umar-2014@pasca.unair.ac.id

Abstract

This research was conducted to find out the way women employees could break through the glass ceiling to get access onto the top positions in the bureaucracy of Sumenep Regency of Madura Island, with patriarchy and religious cultures that usually limit woman's space in public sphere. This research is based on phenomenological approach. It is found that 9 women been able to occupy the top positions, while the other 2 remained at the bottom line as staffs without any career advancement. In conclusion, the actual glass ceilings were inside themselves, such as low motivation, low level of education and competence.

Keywords: Discrimination, social system, woman employee.

Análisis del techo de cristal en la burocracia dentro del patriarcado y la sociedad religiosa

Resumen

Esta investigación se realizó para descubrir la forma en que las empleadas podían romper el techo de cristal para acceder a los puestos más altos en la burocracia de la regencia de Sumenep en la isla de Madura, con patriarcados y culturas religiosas que generalmente limitan el espacio de las mujeres en la esfera pública. Esta investigación se basada en el enfoque fenomenológico. Se encontró que 9 mujeres pudieron ocupar las primeras posiciones, mientras que las otras 2 permanecieron en la línea de fondo como personal sin ningún avance en la carrera. En conclusión, los techos de cristal reales estaban dentro de sí mismos, como la baja motivación, el bajo nivel de educación y la competencia.

Palabras clave: Discriminación, sistema social, empleada.

1. INTRODUCTION

Patriarchy justifies the dominance of one group against another based on gender. Men are considered stronger and more capable than women, so it becomes a common thing if men lead more compared to women (Darwin & Tukiran, 2001). This phenomenon occurs in many groups and organizations, including government organizations (bureaucracy). Besides patriarchal culture, the religious view especially the religion of Islam also affirms that the leader is men. According to Albuti (2005) in Al-Qur'an 4: 34 it is explained that

Allah says: Men are leaders for women because Allah has given some of them (men) over the others (women) and because they (men) spend some of their wealth.

Patriarchy system and religion have placed men to be superior to women in various sectors of life. This research was conducted in Sumenep Regency East Java Province of Indonesia. We choose this location because Sumenep is an area that has a historical background as a kingdom with a thick patriarchal culture. In addition, Sumenep is a district based on 2014 data of the Ministry of Religious Affairs of East Java Province has 99.37% of the total community as Muslims with a very strong religious culture. Interestingly, in the midst of this patriarchal and religious society, few women succeeded in getting the top positions in their career.

According to Reid et al. (2003), the glass ceiling is a metaphor for barriers that restrict or block women's access to the high-level administrative positions within their institutions. Galloway and Shan (2012) argue that the glass ceiling is a metaphor for examining gender disparities between men and women within the workplace. According to Cotter et al. (2001) glass ceiling is an invisible and unbeatable barrier that keep women in the position of minorities on climbing their career paths. Sever (2016) illustrates that the glass ceiling as a syndrome that can be described as is an invisible and unbreakable barrier that categorize women or any minorities group into a special group of professional career advancement, which prevents them from promoting, regardless of their ability and qualifications. Basically, the glass ceiling is something that invisibly has been barriers to access the

top position. Glass ceiling prevents many women from reaching the peak of their career.

Kapur et al. (2016) in their research on Barriers in the Managerial Woman's Journey to the Top concluded there is no denying to changing times, changing mindsets, education, opportunities and steps forward but the change is probably not enough and definitely not adequate to see a larger number of women at topmost levels. So far, some research on the glass ceiling has been done. However, it is mostly done within private organizations, with quantitative methods and only work on the external factors of women that affect their access to achieve the top management positions. It distinguishes this research from others, we work on the public organization that is in bureaucracy, with a qualitative method, and not only researching the external factors, we also include the internal factors of a woman.

The interesting point of this research is that it is done in the organization's Society with patriarchy and religious cultures, where both cultures severely restrict women's movement in the public sector, with royal government background, where the royal and nobility cultures are still highly embedded in their communities (Singh et al., 2018; Mohammadi & Jamali, =2017).

2. METHODOLOGY

This research used qualitative methods with phenomenological approaches, conducted in several bureaucratic institutions in Sumenep. Research subjects were determined by purposive sampling technique, consisted of 11 potential women employees and 2 officials with influence as key informants. The 11 main informants have divided into two groups: Group A was a potential women employee who managed to develop their career up to the top, while Group B was a potential women employee but did not progress in their career and remained at the bottom of the line as a staff. Data collection was done used the observation technique, documentation study, an in-depth interview with the interview guide. The entire result of the observation and in-depth interview was grouped or categorized according to each individual and the themes. We analysed the data to get the conclusion.

3. RESULTS AND DISCUSSION

Out of all possible factor we analysed, turned out that there was a few factors that are likely to be the glass ceiling that affect women's access to the top positions of their career in the bureaucracy.

Eksternal Factor

There are several external factors studied: factors that come from the family Society, work Society, and community Society.

Parents' Mindset

Sumenep which was a kingdom in the past, has a culture of royalty and nobility that turned out to be very influential on the mindset of parents in this area. According to the views of most informants, it seems that many parents want their daughters become ponggebeh, but for economic purposes. In Sumenep, the term ponggebeh which means clerk or employee is usually given to people who work in the formal sector, especially in bureaucracy. By being an employee, they expect their daughters to marry people who are also employees and are well off economically, especially their husbands can be a successful person with growing career. With this expectation, when their child is married and working, they do not get the same portion of the opportunity to enhance their career. Husband has a greater opportunity while his wife is not allowed to develop her career and only supposed to be a staff.

Husband's Ego and Jealousy

Actually many women want to develop her career but in fact, many do not get permission from their husbands. Many women employees who can not go anywhere but the office, they do not even get permission to go to promotional training. Women seem to be confined only from the house to the office and back again to the house. This became an obstacle for duty and responsibility execution, also as

a barrier for her career development since it caused the superiors reluctant to assign a task outside the town because of the permit problem. As a result, superiors tend to choose only men to do it. The husband's ego factor that does not want his wife's career higher than his causes most women employees do not expand her careers and remain as staff only, while jealousy causes women to be confined, unable to perform their duties freely and maximally.

Extended Family's Involvement in Participation Boundary Stipulation in the Workplace

Not only husbands, but many parents and in-laws also interfered the limitation of their daughter-in-law's participation in the workplace. Some informants confessed that when they were bachelors, their parents and the in-laws allowed them to work. After marriage, their parents told them not to leave her jobs to keep having the incomes. But in order to take care of the household, their parents limited their career. Great expectations and opportunities were only given to their husband to develop his career.

Regulation

With the Regent/Mayor appointment as-as Pejabat Pembina Kepegawaian (Staffing Officer) in this era of autonomy government, opens up tremendous opportunities for political influences on the policies it makes, including policies in terms of person appointment for

the promotion. Although at Law of The Republic of Indonesia Number 5 the Year 2014 of section 9 subsection (2) mentioned that the State Civil Servant Officer (ASN) must be free from the influence and intervention of all political parties, but in fact many ASNs were secretly supporting a candidate for the regional leadership of a particular party. Ironically, who have the courage to do this were men employees. The involvement of women employees is rare in this case. With the small number of women in the bureaucracy who dare to involve themselves and favor the political interests of the leadership, it minimizes the chances women can be elected to occupy high and strategic positions (Indriastuti, 2019; Abdul-Rasheed, 2017).

Distrust of Women's Ability

There was no indication which illustrates the lack of assurance in women's abilities that hindered her access to develop her career. Women are judged to have the same ability, even many are seen as more powerful than men. Women are considered capable of holding any position, as they are rated to be more flexible than men (Yang et al., 2019; Soo et al., 2019).

Culture

The influence of patriarchal and religious culture was tiny though. There was no gender discrimination and they do not question women leaders in the bureaucracy. On the other hand, especially in

rural communities, there was a culture of marrying daughters in early age. This culture caused the daughters who are supposed to be informal education to be stalled by marriage. This is because of the negative view of people who are not married. There are many titles for them, such as *praben tuah* (spinster), *jeu jhuduh* (far from the mate), *tak pajuh* (not sold-able), and so on. Therefore, people prefer their daughter to be married earlier. Early marriage culture caused women in rural areas did not have the opportunity to continue their formal education to the top level. With a low level of education, it reduces their chances of entering into the formal workforce as well as in the bureaucracy. In order to develop themselves and improve their skills, they can only participate in non-formal activities such as training organized by the government.

Head of the Region's Background

Head of the region's background proved not to have affected the opportunities of women to occupy the top positions. This was evidenced from the data obtained in the field that in the era of regent with military backgrounds and regent with a religious background (*kyai*) there was once an institution led by women. Even in the era of leadership of a *kyai* regent, there was an institution led by a non-Muslim woman.

Discrimination

There was no discrimination especially from the side of the regulation, from the recruitment to the promotion step in office. Women and men have equal opportunities. Also an equal opportunity for assignment of duties and authority in the work. All the main informants acknowledged that they did not experience discrimination and differentiation in the assignment of duties and authority in the work.

Social Acceptance of Women's Leadership

Women's leadership was well received by the community. Especially women's leadership in the bureaucracy. This was proven, all the informants of Group A feel well received by the community, including among the religious community. Almost all of Group A informants actually feel the public respect very well, similarly in the work society. However, according to them, the response of the community was different if women as their regional leaders, namely as Regents or Vice Regents, most people still can not accept, and used religious reasons, they stated that leader supposed to be a man. This was evident from several times the election of regional heads in Sumenep, no women candidates ever won.

Other Factors

One of the key informants acknowledged that to get to the top positions there were indeed many things and factors that affect, not

only achievement factors and administrative requirements, but there was another factor, the X-factor that influences the management policy. She did not specify what was that meant by the X-factor, but she stated that the luck factor also influences. Group A's informants have several assumptions about the X-factor, such as family relationships, loyalty to the leaders and political interests, and so on. Almost all of the main informants said that the influential X-factor was the communication, proximity and lobby.

This proved the emergence of the term DUK in the bureaucracy environment that should be interpreted as Daftar Urut Kepangkatan (a list of grade order as a basis of consideration in the promotion of employees), splintered into the Daftar Urut Kedekatan (list of proximity). Lack of women's opportunities compared to men to do a non-formal approach with the policymakers affects women's access to get a chance to improve her career. men have many opportunities by joining the same community with their men leaders, such as court tennis enthusiasts, cycling, recitation, etc. Thus compared to women, there was greater opportunity for men to interact in a non-formal approach with the leader.

Internal Factor

In addition to external factors, some internal factors of women themselves, also examined.

Motivation

Although the opportunity was wide open for women, in fact, there were women employees who do not want to be assigned outside the office. This happens for two reasons. Firstly, because she deliberately chooses the comfort zone and did not want to do a complicated job. Secondly, because she chooses a safe zone, does not want to risk. This condition was supported by the statement of key informants who say that there were some potential women who do not want to be appointed in the office even though her grade was enough to fulfil the requirement. One key informant confessed that based on his experience as an influential team member in employee career development, approximately 30% of women who want to grow but do not have access, and the rest of it did not want to develop themselves.

Level of Education and Competence

Most women employees that joined the selection to become an employee only have a high school diploma. With a high school diploma, she will get the II/a grade while the requirement to occupy a position in the low-level manager (Echelon IV) at least an III/bin grade. It takes a long time to get there. Although if they could continue her study or did a diploma adjustments, it still takes at least 14 years to achieve the grade. In fact, only a small fraction of them was continuing their schooling so they can develop themselves and their careers. Very

few women qualified both for the administration process and competence to have a position. Even if there were a few people, they had a lower grade than men. For Echelon II positions the probability was very small, the informant estimated it as no more than 1%.

Women's Multiple Roles

Multiple roles make women employees unable to focus maximally both in on their work and career. They still prioritize the domestic household duties, often refused to join the training and duty out of town. Usually, they did this refusal with the reason that the household tasks that could not be abandoned, such as taking care of her small children. They avoided husbands complain that possibly trigger a dispute, for a safe and harmonious family. Finally, they reached the position that the family priority was the husband's career, the wives have no ambition to pursue a career, just work and had the salary. Only a small percentage of women employee could do it well and actually improved her education and career.

Reliability in Dealing with the Pressure

Most women employees were less tough facing the work pressure. Some key informants acknowledged that they were sometimes not strong enough to face the task's pressure. This was reinforced by the statement of key informants who said that many women employees who have occupied top positions were deported

elsewhere because of their inability to cope with the pressure in their duties.

Woman' Self Concept and Self Perception

The women's concept and perception towards herself greatly influence the level of motivation for his career development. From the data provided, Group A and Group B informants have different concepts and perceptions on themselves as women. The majority of Group An informants viewed that women themselves have the same rights as men, both for access to education and employment. They believe that as long as they were given the opportunity to go forward and develop, women could be greater than men. Unlike Group A, Group B informants thought that women do not have to be great in career and outdoors. For this group, success did not have to be seen by the eyes of the community or in the career form, success was important only to be acknowledged by the children and husbands because they could manage the household well.

4. CONCLUSION

The result of the discussion shows that the glass ceiling in the bureaucracy within the patriarchy and religion Society, it was not a factor of patriarchy and religious culture itself. The factor of parent's mindset, jealousy factor and husband's ego, extended family involvement in determining the limits of participation in the

workplace, and employment regulation were the external factors that become glass ceilings for women to towards the peak of her career. The background of the head of the region has no effect. Discrimination against women and distrust of women's abilities were not found in the bureaucracy environment in Sumenep. For patriarchal and religious cultural factors, although there was some influence, it was indeed small because the reality was society already open to change and their social acceptance to the women leadership turned out to be good.

Precisely, a glass ceiling for women in terms of culture was the early marriage. The lack of women's opportunities compared to men for non-formal approach with policymakers was also a glass ceiling associated with the X-factor that can also affect access to the peak of a woman's career. As for internal factors, the low motivation of women employees to develop themselves, the low level of education and competence possessed, the multiple roles, the toughness in facing pressure, and the self-concept perception as a woman was the biggest glass ceilings in the career of women in bureaucracy.

REFERENCES

- Abdul-Rasheed, S. L. 2017. **Parental Socio-Economic Status and E-crime among the Undergraduate Students of Universities in South-West of Nigeria.** UCT Journal of Social Sciences and Humanities Research, 5(3), 32-40.
- ALBUTHI, M. 2005. **Women in the Western and Islamic Law Views.** Yogyakarta: Suluh Press. Indonesia.

COTTER, D., HERMSEN, J., OVADIA, S., & VANNEMAN, R. 2001. **The Glass Ceiling Effect**. Social Forces. Vol. 80, No 2: 655-681. UK.

DARWIN, M., & TUKIRAN, E. 2001. **Defending Patriakhi Culture**. Yogyakarta: Ford Foundation and Population Research Center Universitas Gadjah Mada. Indonesia.

GALLOWAY, B., & SHAN, T. 2012. **The Glass Ceiling: Examining the Advancement of Women in the Domain of Athletic Administration**. McNair Scholars Research Journal. Vol. 5, N° 1: 51-62. USA.

INDRIASTUTI, H. 2019. **Entrepreneurial inattentiveness, relational capabilities and value co-creation to enhance marketing performance**. Giap journals. Vol 7. N° 3. India.

KAPUR, S., MEHROTRA, R., & BANERJEE, N. 2016. **This Far and No Further: Barriers in the Managerial Woman's**. Pertanika Journal of Social Sciences & humanities. Vol. 24, N° 3: 953-970. Malaysia.

Mohammadi, D., & Jamali, A. 2017. **The Determinants of Forward-Looking Information Disclosure in Tehran Stock Exchange**. UCT Journal of Management and Accounting Studies, 5(3), 25-31.

REID, M., KERR, B., & MILLER, W. 2003. **Glass Walls and Glass Ceilings: Women's Representation in State and Municipal Bureaucracies**. United States of America: Praeger. USA.

SEVER, H. 2016. **The Comparison of Glass Ceiling Perception of Employees Working in Public and Private Enterprises**. American Journal of Industrial and Business Management. Vol. 6, pp. 577-588. USA.

Singh, P., Teoh, S. H., Cheong, T. H., Md Rasid, N. S., Kor, L. K., & Md Nasir, N. A. 2018. **The Use of Problem-Solving Heuristics Approach in Enhancing STEM Students Development of Mathematical Thinking**. International Electronic Journal of

Mathematics Education, 13(3), 289-303.
<https://doi.org/10.12973/iejme/3921>

SOO, M., SHELBY, R., & JOHNSON, K. 2019. **Optimizing the patient experience during breast biopsy.** Journal of Breast Imaging. wbz001, <https://doi.org/10.1093/jbi/wbz001>. UK.

YANG, Y., PAN, T., & ZHANG, J. 2019. **Global optimization of Norris derivative filtering with application for near-infrared analysis of serum urea nitrogen.** Scientific Research Publishing. Vol 10. N° 5. China.



**UNIVERSIDAD
DEL ZULIA**

opción

Revista de Ciencias Humanas y Sociales

Año 35, N° 20, (2019)

Esta revista fue editada en formato digital por el personal de la Oficina de Publicaciones Científicas de la Facultad Experimental de Ciencias, Universidad del Zulia.
Maracaibo - Venezuela

www.luz.edu.ve

www.serbi.luz.edu.ve

produccioncientifica.luz.edu.ve